April 27, 2022

The Honorable Andrea Stewart-Cousins  
Senate Majority Leader  
188 State Street  
Legislative Office Building, Room 907  
Albany, NY 12247

The Honorable Carl Heastie  
Assembly Speaker  
188 State Street  
Legislative Office Building, Room 932  
Albany, NY 12248

Re: Call for the passage of A.7389-C/S.6486-D to institute a two-year moratorium on new fossil fuel permits for proof-of-work cryptocurrency mining and to direct an environmental review

Dear Majority Leader Stewart-Cousins and Speaker Carl Heastie:

We, the undersigned organizations, businesses, labor, and faith groups, write today to urge you to swiftly pass A.7389-C (Kelless)/S.6486-D (Parker) to place a two-year moratorium on the issuance of new air permits and air permit renewals for electric generating facilities that use fossil-fuels that provides in whole, or in part, energy used for Proof-of-Work cryptocurrency mining, and to direct the Department of Environmental Conservation (DEC) to conduct an environmental review.

These “mining” activities, particularly Proof-of-Work (PoW) cryptocurrency mining use enormous amounts of energy to power the mega computers needed to validate transactions on their network. For New York to meet its climate goals, it will be critical for energy consumption to decrease and for fossil fuels to be phased out – this legislation is necessary to help achieve these steps.

Should this activity expand in New York, it could drastically undermine New York’s climate goals established under the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act.

This legislation takes a very measured approach to this emerging concern by placing a two-year moratorium on permits for fossil fuel-based proof-of-work cryptocurrency mining and instructing DEC to conduct an environmental review of cryptocurrency mining. This legislation would not impact current operations, or operations that utilize renewable energy sources. Additionally, the legislation does not prevent anyone from purchasing or using cryptocurrencies.

Digital currencies require authentication to prevent fraudulent transactions. PoW is the method that has the most significant energy demands. In PoW authentication, complex mathematical equations are assigned to each transaction and miners compete to solve them. The first one to solve an equation authenticates the transaction and wins currency for their effort. The equations can only be solved by brute force guesswork, so the person or company with the most computational power wins the most currency. With some currencies valued at over $40,000 a coin, albeit in a highly speculative market, a global
digital gold rush is taking place with millions of mega “computers,” known as ASIC’s (Application Specific Integrated Circuits), competing for an edge in the market.

In New York, crypto mining operations using warehouses full of computers have set up shop in upstate areas siphoning electricity from New York’s grid, “re-powering” defunct fossil-fueled power plants, thus seriously jeopardizing the state’s progress on and meeting mandates for reducing greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions.

Environmental concerns regarding proof-of-work mining can be summarized as the following:

- **The energy use from proof-of-work mining is out of this world.** If Bitcoin were a country, it would rank in the top 30 countries of energy users worldwide—between Norway and Argentina. The Bitcoin network uses about the same amount of electricity as Washington State does yearly.

- **Proof-of-work mining stands to jeopardize meeting global and New York State climate goals.** New York State has goals under the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act to reduce greenhouse gas emissions 80% below 1990 levels by 2050, achieve 70% renewable energy for electricity by 2030. New York doesn’t currently have enough renewable energy to power existing needs, let alone an industry this energy consumptive. The energy consumption from proof-of-work mining operations would prevent the state from meeting these important goals.

- **Proof-of-work mining at power plants could jeopardize water quality.** These facilities require large quantities of water to generate energy, and the water returned to water bodies or wastewater treatment facilities is significantly hotter than the water withdrawn. Fluctuations in water temperatures can negatively impact the chemistry of water bodies and the ability of certain aquatic species to survive, as well as wastewater infrastructure.

- **Proof-of-work mining generates enormous levels of electronic waste.** The ASIC miners used at most mining operations have a lifespan of between 18 to 24 months. According to one estimate, cryptocurrency mining produces 30,700 tons of e-waste annually. This waste impacts low-income communities disproportionately.

Additionally, there are very few jobs created by crypto mining, with profits accruing to the few, but the environmental impacts affect us all, particularly low-income communities that are often located near fossil fuel power plants and have been disproportionately affected by ongoing and legacy contamination. Additionally, BIPOC and low-income communities are often near polluting peaker plants – these polluting facilities could be kept online longer if crypto mining continues to ramp up statewide energy demands.

Most of the energy generated at these power plants will not go into the electrical grid. Instead, it is being used by private technology companies where the financial rewards remain with the companies themselves and their investors, while the environmental impacts are externalized, impacting our community, our state, and our ever-warming world.

There are other forms of validation for cryptocurrencies that can be, and are, used, such as the proof-of-stake mining methodology, which utilizes over 99% less energy than proof-of-work mining. Other less energy-consumptive methods include proof-of-authority, open representative voting, federated consensus, proof-of-activity, and proof-of-burn.

Passing A.7389-C/S.6486-D to pause proof-of-work cryptocurrency mining that utilizes fossil fuels is critical to ensure New York doesn’t undercut its landmark climate law and protects communities. We urge swift passage of this legislation this session.

Thank you for your time and consideration of our comments.

---


2 Ibid.


Sincerely,

1199 Service Employees International Union, Upstate
Division
Todd Hobbler
Executive Vice-President

Climate Reality Project
Joseph Pepe, Climate Leader

Coastal Research and Education Society of Long Island
Dr. Artie Kopelman
President

Action Center on Race and the Economy
Michele Gilliam, Deputy Political Director

Committee to Preserve the Finger Lakes
Peter Gamba
Treasurer and founding member

Alliance for a Green Economy
Andra Leimanis
Communications & Outreach Director

Committee to Preserve the Finger Lakes
Abi Buddington
Secretary

Billsboro Winery
Vinny Aliperti
Co-Owner

Cattaraugus-Chautauqua for Clean Water
Glenn Wahl
Co-Founder

CUNY School of Law - Environmental Justice Coalition
Jill Sifah Sigman
Board Member

Cayuga Lake Environmental Action Now
John V. Dennis
Steering Committee Chair

Denizens for the Biosphere
Regi Teasley
Founder

Center for Urban Environmental Reform
Rebecca Bratspies
Director

Dryden Resource Awareness Coalition
Marie McRae
Spokesperson

Clean Air Coalition of WNY
Chris Murawksi
Executive Director

Earthjustice
Elizabeth Moran
New York Policy Advocate

Climate Reality Finger Lakes Greater Region NY
Chapter
Thomas Hirasuna
Co-Chair

Earthkeeper Health Resources
Amy Rosmarin
Executive Director

Climate Reality New York State Coalition
Thomas Hirasuna, Co-Lead

Elmirans and Friends Against Fracking
Doug Couchon
Co-Founder
Environmental Advocates NY
Conor Bambrick
Director of Climate Policy

Food & Water Watch
Eric Weltman
Senior Organizer

Foodscraps360
Diana Wright
Owner

Judith Enck, Former EPA Regional Administrator

Fossil Free Tompkins
Irene Weiser, Coordinator

FrackBustersNY
Mary Finneran, Co-founder

Gas Free Seneca
Joseph Campbell
President

Geneva City Council
Robert K. Camera
City Councilor

Grassroots Environmental Education
Patricia Wood
Executive Director

Green Education and Legal Fund
Mark Dunlea
Chair

Indian Point Safe Energy Coalition
Marilyn Elie
Organizer

Keuka Spring Vineyards
Leonard Wiltberger, Owner

Little Lakes Sustainability Network
Tawn Feeney

Mothers Out Front Dutchess County
Caroline Fenner
Communications and Outreach

Mothers Out Front Tompkins
Sheila Out
Organizing Member

Nassau Hiking & Outdoor Club
Guy Jacob
Conservation Chair

Natural Resources Defense Council
Richard Schrader
New York Policy Director

New York City Environmental Justice Alliance
Daniel Chu
Energy Planner

New York Communities for Change
Jonathan Westin
Executive Director

New York League of Conservation Voters
Patrick McClellan
Director of Policy

New York Progressive Action Network
Cari Gardner
Vice Chair

NY Water Action
Ann Finneran

NY Water Project
Michelle O'Leary
Organizer

NYCD16 Indivisible
Natalie Polvere & Iris Hiskey Arno
Co-chairs, Environment Committee

NYPiRG
Anne Rabe
Environmental Policy Director
Occupy Bergen County
Sally Jane Gellert

PAUSE (People of Albany United for Safe Energy)
Mark Dunlea
Chair

Ulster Activists
Susan Denton

People for a Healthy Environment
Doug Couchon
President

Protecting Our Waters
Iris Marie Bloom
Executive Director

Public Utility Law Project of New York
Richard Berkley
Executive Director

Resident Allied for the Future of Tioga (RAFT)
Gerri Wiley
Facilitator

Riverkeeper
Jeremy Cherson
Senior Manager of Government Affairs

Sane Energy Project
Kim Fraczek
Director

Seatuck Environmental Association
Enrico G. Nardone, Esq.
Executive Director

Seneca Lake Guardian
Yvonne Taylor
Vice President

Sierra Club Atlantic Chapter
Roger Downs
Conservation Director

Sierra Club Long Island Group
Gail Payne
Energy Chair

South Shore Audubon Society
Brien Weiner
President

St. Albar's Episcopal Church
The Rev. Julie Calhoun-Bryant
Rector

StopCricketValley.org
Bill Kish
Co-organizer

Strong Economy for All Coalition
Michael Kink, esq.
Executive Director

Susquehanna Group of Sierra Club
Valdi Weiderpass
Chairperson

Syracuse Peace Council
Carol Baum
Organizer

The Climate Reality Project: Capital Region, NY
Chapter
Laura Faulk
Co-chair

The Diocese Of Central New York
The Rev Jeffrey Knox

The Ginger Cat Bed & Breakfast
Gita Devi
Owner

The Solidarity Committee of the Capital District
Fred Pfeiffer
Charter/ Exec Board Member

Tompkins County Climate Protection Initiative
Peter Bardaglio
Coordinator

Ulster Activists
Amy Kletter
Chair, environment committee
United for Action
Ling Tsou
Co-founder

United For Clean Energy
Tina Volz-Bongar
Community Organizer

Veterans for Climate Justice
Colleen Boland
Founder

WESPAC Foundation, Inc.
Nada Khader, Executive Director

New Yorkers for Clean Power
Betta Broad
Campaign Director

Climate Smart Philipstown
Krystal Ford
Climate Smart Coordinator

Denizens of the Biosphere
Regi Teasley
Founder

SENeca LAKE GUARDIAN BUSINESS COALITION:

12th Moon Astrology
17th Century Suds
A Holism In Sync
A Stone’s Throw B&B
Abelson Law Office
Acorn Designs
Admiral Peabody’s Lakeside Lodging
Advanced Remodeling
Airy Acres Vineyard
AKS Apartments, LLC
Aligned Business Concepts
Amazing Grace Bed & Breakfast
American Canoe Association, Atlantic Division
Ann Cain Crusade, R.N., M.S., L.Ac
Ann Sheldon, Life Coach
Another Time Antiques
Applegate Toys
Area Records

Network for a Sustainable Tomorrow (NEST)
Adam Flint
Director of Clean Energy Programs

ResistSpectra
Marie Insera
Coordinator Group Representative

Rockland Goes Green
Susan Freiman
Founder
Long Island Progressive Coalition
Lisa Tyson
Director

All Our Energy
George Povall
Executive Director

Clean Air Coalition of Greater Ravena-Coeymans
Barbara Heinzen
Steering Group member

FracTracker Alliance
Shannon Smith
Executive Director

Argetsinger Vineyards
Atwater Vineyards
Autumn Leaves Used Books
B&B: 448 East Broadway LLC
Bagley’s Poplar Ridge Vineyard
Barnstormer Winery
Barry Family Vineyards
Bear Meadow Folk Instruments
Beef N’ Brew
Bella Stone Massage
Bellwether Cidery
Benedict Accounting and Tax Service
Berta’s Café
Bill Carini Gardens
Billsboro Winery
Bitterwind Hop Farm
Bl.ink
Blackberry Inn B&B
Blecher Electric
Bloomer Creek Vineyard
Boathouse Beer Garden
Bob and Dee
Bob and June’s Organic Coffee
Bostwick House B&B
Bottomless Brewing
Boundary Breaks Vineyard
Bout Time B & B
Bramble: Community Herbalism
Bread ‘N’ Roses
Brian Grafstein LMT
Brian Keeler, Artist
Bumble & Co. B & B
Bunnell Associates
Burdett House B&B
Burford Books
Buried Treasures Organic Farm
Buttonwood Creek Tree Farm
Calm Reflections
Camp Seneca Lake
Cappy’s
Capricorn Hill Farms
Captain Bill’s & Seneca Harbor Station
Cash and Caring Auction Services
Castle Creek Kombucha
Catherine Cottages
Cathy Emilian Design
Cayuga Chiropractic & Wellness
Cayuga Morning Star B & B
Caywood Vineyards
Charles Limousine Service
Chateau Lafayette Reneau
Chefs for the Marcellus
Cherry Orchard B & B
Church Creative Flooring, Inc.
Cindy Lane-Newcomb; Raven’s Landing
Clean Team
Clear Path Healing Arts Center
Climbing Bines Hop Farm and Brewery
Cloud 9 Wellness
Compost International
Cortland Beer Company, LLC
Cottage Views B & B
Cotton Club at the Windmill
Cowlick Farms
Creating Change
Creativelink Photo/Graphics Services
Creekside Cafe

Crestwood Pools Inc.
Crooked Lake Winery
Cummins Nursery
Curry Creek Vineyards
Custom Care Pharmacy
D. Bordwell Editorial Services
Damiani Wine Cellars
Dan Rapaport Consulting
Dano’s Heuriger
Daphne’s Delights
Darlene Bordwell Photography
David Mooney-State Farm Insurance
Deep Lake Industries
DeMarco Vineyards
Derek’s Diner
Dewitt Park Inn
Digital Wires
Discovery Massage
Dixie O’Connor, Fine Arts
Down to Earth Markets
Dr. Konstantin Frank Vinifera Wine Cellars
DS Hoffman, Luthier
Dundee Scottish Festival of the Finger Lakes
Eagle Crest Vineyards/ O-Neh-Da Vineyard
Earthgirl Flowers
Earthgirl Pottery
East Side Dog Services
Echoes of the Glen B & B
Edible Finger Lakes
Eli Thomas Art
Ely Fruit Farms
Emery Vineyards
Eminence Road Farm Winery
Enigma Skin Care Studio
Eremita Winery
Eve’s Cidery
Evolving Studios
Exercise Enterprise
Factivist
Faith Muirhead, Educational Consultant
Farm Kind
Farmer Ground Flour
Farmshed CNY
Finger Lakes Clean Waters Initiative, Inc
Finger Lakes Concierge
Finger Lakes Distilling
Finger Lakes Estate and Auction Company
Finger Lakes Florist
Finger Lakes Foie
FINGER LAKES WINE BUSINESS COALITION (FLXWBC) MEMBERS:

Amazing Grace Bed & Breakfast Est. 1999
Argetsinger Vineyards Est. 1996
Atwater Estate Vineyards Est. 1999
A Stone’s Throw Bed & Breakfast Est. 2012
Backacres Vineyard Est. 1947
Bagley’s Poplar Ridge Vineyards Est. 1980
Barnstormer Winery Est. 2013
Barry Family Cellars Est. 2011
Bellangelo Est. 2002
Billsboro Winery Est. 2007
Black Diamond Farm, LLC Est. 1994
Bloomer Creek Vineyard Est. 1999
Bostwick House B&B Est. 2007
Boundary Breaks Vineyard Est. 2008
Bully Hill Vineyards Est. 1970
Ann Cain Crusade Acupuncture and Herbal Medicine Est. 2006
Castel Grisch Winery Est. 1986
Catherine Cottages Est. 2003
Cherry Orchard B & B Est. 1988
Clean Team Est. 2000
Climbing Bines Craft Ale Co. and Hop Farm Est. 2013
Compost International Est. 2010
Costello, Cooney & Fearon, PLLC Est. 1896
Cottage Views Bed & Breakfast Est. 2013
Curry Creek Vineyards Est. 2003
Damiani Wine Cellars Est. 2000
Damiani Vineyards Est. 1997
Dan Rapaport Consulting Est. 1982
Davis Vineyard Est. 1998
Dr. Frank’s Vinifera Wine Cellars Est. 1962
Echoes of the Glen Bed & Breakfast Est. 2005
Eli Thomas Art Est. 1990
Eminence Road Farm Winery Est. 2008
Eremita Winery Est. 2011
Experience! The Finger Lakes Est. 2007
Eve’s Cidery Est. 2002
Fall Bright, The Wine Makers Shoppe Est. 1978
Finger Lakes Cider House Est.2014
Finger Lakes Mill Creek Cabins Est. 2006
Finger Lakes Solar Co-op Est. 2014
First Flight Est. 1987
FLX Wienery Est. 2014
Forge Cellars Est. 2008
Frontenac Point Vineyard – Estate Winery Est. 1979
Ginger Cat Bed & Breakfast Est. 2008
Ginny Lee Cafe Est. 1983
Good for Business Est. 1999
Goose Watch Winery Est. 1997
Hazlitt 1852 Vineyards, Inc. Est. 1985
Heart & Hands Wine Company Est. 2006
Hector Wine Company Est. 2009
Hermann J. Wiemer Vineyards Est.1979
Heron Hill Vineyard Est. 1977
Hidden Marsh Distillery Est. 2007
Hosmer Winery Est. 1985
Hunt Country Vineyard Est. 1981
Idol Ridge Winery Est. 2013
Ingle Vineyard Est. 1972
Inspire Moore Winery and Vineyard Est. 2007
Interludes Est. 2000
Italy Hill Produce Est. 2009
J. Crytzer Woodworking Est. 2003
J.R. Dill Winery Est. 2009
Keuka Spring Vineyards Est. 1985
King Ferry makers of Treleaven Wines Est. 1984
Lacey Magruder Vineyard & Winery Est. 2011
Lake House & Cottage Rental Est. 1997
Lakeshore Vineyard Est. 1982
Lamoreaux Landing Wine Cellars Est. 1990
Loan Chiropractic Est. 1986
Locke’s Glen, LLC Vacation Rentals Est. 2015
Lost Kingdom Brewery Est. 2014
Macro Mamas Est. 1992
Magnolia Place Bed & Breakfast Est. 1997
McGregor Vineyard Est. 1971
Medleys Est. 1993
Montezuma Winery Est. 2001
Nautical Nights Est. 2000
Nedloh Brewing Company Est. 2014
New Vines Bed & Breakfast Est. 2007
Northside Wine and Spirits
NYSP2I Est. 2005
Old Fashioned Flowers, Fernville Farm Est. 2011
O-Neh-Da & Eagle Crest Vineyards Est. 1872
Peggy Haine – Food and Wine Writer Est. 1984
Penguin Bay Winery Est. 2006
Pompous Ass Winery Est. 2008
Ports of New York, Est. 2000
Rasta Ranch Vineyards Est. 1993
Ravines Wine Cellar Est. 2000
Redbyrd Orchard Cider Est. 2010
Red Newt Cellars, Inc. Est. 1998
Regional Access Est. 1989
Renovus Energy Est. 2003
Robinia Redux Locust Fence Post Plantation Est. 1979
Sawmill Creek Vineyard Est. 1852
Savor Life Radio Est. 1994
Seneca 7 Est. 2011
Shalestone Vineyards, LLC Est. 1995
Shaw Vineyard Est. 1980
Sheldrake Point Winery Est. 1997
Silver Springs Winery LLC Est. 2001
Silver Thread Vineyard Est. 1991
South Hill Cider Est. 2013
Stone Boat Computing Est. 2011
Stone Cat Cafe Est. 1999
Stone Pillow Pottery Est. 2012
Stoney Lonesome Farm, LLC Est. 2012

Strategic Coaching Est. 2014
Sun Dance Creations Est. 1998
Sunrise Landing Bed and Breakfast Est. 2004
Sustainable Viticulture Systems Est. 2013
Suzanne Fine Regional Cuisine Est. 2003
Swedish Hill Vineyard, Inc. Est. 1985
Themis and Thread Est. 2013
The OCD Art Galley Est. 2013
The Pearl of Seneca Lake, Inc. Est. 2005
Three Brothers Wineries and Estates Est. 2007
The Rose Petal Inn Est. 2014
Two Goats Brewing Est. 2010
Ventosa Vineyards Est. 2005
Vineyard View Winery Est. 2013
Wagner Valley Brewing Company Est. 1997
Wagner Vineyards Est. 1976
Wide Awake Bakery Est. 2010

CC: Members of the New York State Assembly
Members of the New York State Senate