September 24, 2019

Energy Division
California Public Utilities Commission
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102
Email: EDTariffUnit@cpuc.ca.gov

Re: Earthjustice and Sierra Club’s Comments in Support of Alternate Draft Resolution E-5007

Earthjustice and Sierra Club write to express our support for Alternate Draft Resolution E-5007 (“the Alternate”). As originally proposed, Resolution E-5007 would inexplicably award Southern California Gas Company (“SoCalGas”) shareholder incentives for activities related to the development of efficiency codes and standards (“C&S”) despite actively working against the adoption of more stringent standards.¹ The Alternate provides much needed accountability, finding instead that “[t]here is a serious question whether SoCalGas merits recovery for its Codes and Standards advocacy.”² To ensure these questions are fully vetted and that the appropriate consequences result from SoCalGas’ actions, the Alternate also properly requires the California Public Utilities Commission (“Commission”) to issue an Order to Show Cause (“OSC”), “giving parties the opportunity to address and resolve issues regarding the 2016 and 2017 [C&S] awards.”³

While Earthjustice and Sierra Club support the Alternate’s contemplated OSC regarding SoCalGas’ 2016 and 2017 C&S activities, we also note that a Motion of the Public Advocates Office (“PAO Motion”) for an OSC related to SoCalGas’ continued 2018 C&S activities remains

¹ Draft Resolution E-5007 at 30 (July 11, 2019); Decision 18-05-041, Decision Addressing Energy Efficiency Business Plans, Application 17-01-013 et al., at 139, 141–44 (May 31, 2018), http://docs.cpuc.ca.gov/PublishedDocs/Published/G000/M215/K706/215706139.PDF (stripping SoCalGas of its “role in statewide codes and standards advocacy” due to the “potential for SoCalGas to misuse ratepayer funds” following the discovery of “internal emails among SoCalGas managers discussing the potential for the proposed standards to raise the cost of some gas furnaces and thereby encourage fuel switching away from natural gas”).
² Alternate Resolution E-5007 at 2 (Sept. 12, 2019).
³ Id. at 31.
pending. The PAO Motion should be granted and consolidated with the OSC for 2016 and 2017 C&S activities so that the entirety of SoCalGas' actions related to C&S can be collectively scrutinized. Indeed, Earthjustice and Sierra Club have serious concerns that in response to the PAO Motion, SoCalGas misled the Commission in stating that “SoCalGas and its consultant have not engaged in any advocacy under the statewide Energy Efficiency (‘EE’) Codes & Standards program (federal or statewide) since July 10, 2018.” From an initial investigation, it appears that SoCalGas has continued to actively work to undermine federal efficiency standards through direct participation in trade groups such as the American Public Gas Association (“APGA”). These concerns are best addressed through an OSC that spans SoCalGas C&S activities from 2016 to the present.

The APGA, an entity with an apparent climate denier as its President and CEO, purports to represent the interests of publicly owned gas utilities. Yet SoCalGas, an investor-owned utility, is both a financial contributor and participant. SoCalGas’ 2018 General Order No. 77-M filings identifies $50,000 in total contributions to the APGA, a $25,000 increase from the year prior. SoCalGas also travels to APGA conferences, speaking on topics such as “Threats &

---

4 Motion of the Public Advocates Office for an Order to Show Cause Why Southern California Gas Company Should Not Be Sanctioned for Violating a Commission Order and Rule 1.1 of the Commission’s Rules of Practice and Procedure, Rulemaking 13-11-005 (July 15, 2019), http://docs.cpuc.ca.gov/PublishedDocs/Efile/G000/M312/K060/312060052.PDF.
5 Response of Southern California Gas Company (U 904 G) to the Motion of the Public Advocates Office for an Order to Show Cause Why Southern California Gas Company Should Not Be Sanctioned for Violating a Commission Order and Rule 1.1 of the Commission’s Rules of Practice and Procedure, Rulemaking 13-11-005, at 1 (July 30, 2019), http://docs.cpuc.ca.gov/PublishedDocs/Efile/G000/M313/K821/313821404.PDF.
6 See APGA, APGA Staff, https://www.apga.org/aboutus/staff (Bert Kalisch, President & CEO); Attach. A, Nov. 19, 2013 Email from Bert Kalisch to Joseph Bast, then President of the Heartland Institute (describing the Heartland Institute as “an outstanding public policy think tank”), Nov. 26, 2013 Email from Joseph Bast to Aaron Stover, Frank Lasee, Jeff Judson, James Taylor, and Jay Lehr (stating “Bert is a global warming skeptic . . . understands that environmental groups are targeting his industry and will come down full force once they vanquish the coal guys, and his members are small town Red state types who ‘get it’ as well”). The Heartland Institute works to seed mistrust of climate science. See Joseph Bast, Winning the Global Warming War, The Heartland Institute (Feb. 17, 2017), https://www.heartland.org/news-opinion/news/winning-the-global-warming-war (“Real peer-reviewed science shows the human impact on climate is probably too small to measure and not worth trying to prevent or undo.”); Justin Gillis and Leslie Kaufman, Leak Offers Glimpse of Campaign Against Climate Science, New York Times (Feb. 15, 2012), https://www.nytimes.com/2012/02/16/science/earth/in-heartland-institute-leak-a-plan-to-discredit-climate-teaching.html.
Trends in California” and is an active participant in the APGA’s Direct Use Task Group (“DUTG”).

Through its involvement in the DUTG, SoCalGas appears to continue to work to weaken efficiency standards. The mission of the DUTG is to “[c]ounter the regulatory and legislative threats to the direct use of natural gas by advocating policies, regulations & legislation that promote natural gas direct use.” Among its stated 2018 accomplishments are “[m]ultiple meetings” with the U.S. Department of Energy (“DOE”) regarding “appliance efficiency standards and the process for establishing standards” and filing of a Petition for Rulemaking with DOE (“Petition”), together with the American Gas Association, Natural Gas Supply Association, and National Propane Gas Association, requesting the withdrawal of proposed standards for residential water heaters and the issuance of an interpretative rule establishing a separate class for furnaces and water heaters “using condensing combustion technology.” The Petition was filed on October 18, 2018, well after SoCalGas asserted it no longer engaged in federal efficiency standards advocacy. Notably, the California Energy Commission “strongly” opposed the Petition, stating that the “effect of granting the petition would be to put a cap on the energy efficiency of gas furnaces and water heaters by distinguishing products based on technologies that drive improvement in energy efficiency. This is an untenable approach to energy efficiency standards.” In seeking to create a separate class of appliances that specifically rely on inefficient combustion technology, the Petition would foreclose the transition to more efficient solutions.

SoCalGas’ representation to this Commission that it has “not engaged in any advocacy” on federal efficiency standards while continuing to finance and participate in trade associations working to weaken efficiency standards is of serious concern and appears to violate its obligation to “never to mislead the Commission or its staff by artifice or false statement” under Rule 1.1. SoCalGas’ potential disregard for Commission orders, its material misrepresentation, and its continued efforts to undermine efficiency codes and standards, potentially at ratepayer expense,

---

8 Attach. B, APGA Annual Conference, General Session Program (George Minter of SoCalGas speaking on “Threats & Trends in California” on July 30, 2019); Attach. C, Nov. 29, 2018 Email from Daniel Lapato, APGA Director of Government Affairs, to Undisclosed Recipients (listing attendees to the December DUTG in-person meeting, including Deanna Haines, SoCalGas Director, Energy & Environmental Policy); Attach. D, APGA, Slide Presentation for January 30, 2019 DUTG Meeting, at Slide 4 (identifying SoCalGas as DUTG participant).
9 Attach. D at Slide 5.
through third party intermediaries such as the APGA demand a full investigation. The Commission should approve Alternate Draft Resolution E-5007, with the modification that the Commission issue an OSC that encompasses SoCalGas C&S activities, and the appropriate consequences for those activities, from 2016 to the present.

Thank you for your consideration of these comments.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/
Matthew Vespa
Earthjustice
50 California Street, Suite 500
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 217-2123
Email: mvespa@earthjustice.org

Katherine Ramsey
Sierra Club
2101 Webster Street, Suite 1300
Oakland, CA 94612
Telephone: (415) 977-5627
Email: katherine.ramsey@sierraclub.org

Cc: Parties to Service List of R.13-11-005
   Erica Petrofsky, erica.petrofsky@cpuc.ca.gov
   Peter Lai, peter.lai@cpuc.ca.gov
   Edward Randolph, edward.randolph@cpuc.ca.gov
Gentlemen,

I may have told you earlier about the meeting Aaron Stover and I had — I’m getting a sense of de javu writing this, but too late now -- with Bert Kalisch, president of the American Public Gas Association in Wash DC last week, but I don’t think I had this attachment to send you. It was very nice of him to share this strategy document with me... please don’t forward it to others.

Their big issue is “direct use,” that is, use of natural gas rather than electricity in homes and businesses. Enviros see that as an obstacle to their vision of a completely electric world powered by wind and solar.

The APGA is small, just 10 full-time staff and about a $4 million budget. They aren’t likely to support us. But Bert is a global warming skeptic, is working to get Steve Goreham to speak at their next annual meeting, understands that environmental groups are targeting his industry and will come down full force once they vanquish the coal guys, and his members are small town Red state types who “get it” as well.

I’m hoping it will be easier to get APGA to speak out on climate change than AGA and the other bigger organizations, and that Aaron can get access to APGA members and through them, some of their biggest customers and other industry folks who see the threat and can contribute.

Joe

Joseph Bast
President
The Heartland Institute
Chicago, IL 60606
Phone [redacted]
Email [redacted]
Web site http://www.heartland.org

Support The Heartland Institute today!

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message (and any associated files) is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is confidential, subject to copyright or constitutes a trade secret. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any dissemination, copying or distribution of this message, or files associated with this message, is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify us immediately by replying to the message and deleting it from your computer.
Joe—

Here is the document I mentioned. For a small organization like ours, the scope is overwhelming.

Thanks
Bert

From: Joseph Bast [mailto:]
Sent: Tuesday, November 19, 2013 8:19 AM
To: Bert Kalisch
Subject: Re: APGA

We enjoyed it as well, looking forward to working with you.

Joe

Sent from my Verizon Wireless 4G LTE DROID

Bert Kalisch wrote:

Joe—

I really enjoyed our visit yesterday. The Heartland Institute is an outstanding public policy think tank that has performed very well under your leadership.

As we discussed, I followed-up with Audrey and there is an opportunity for a pro/con piece in the next issue of The SOURCE magazine. The piece would need to be in to Audrey by December 10th. Our Annual Conference Committee meets in late January to make final decisions on speakers. I am hopeful that Steve Goreham will be selected. In any event, there will be room for at least one piece next year on natural gas penned by Steve and/or Heartland.

Best wishes for a successful DC visit and your 17 meetings, a safe return to the Windy City, and a wonderful Thanksgiving holiday with your family.

Thanks
Bert

________________________________________
Bert Kalisch
American Public Gas Association
Washington, D.C. 20002
www.apga.org
PLEASE JOIN US AT THESE UPCOMING EVENTS:

2014 Gas Supply Conference & APGA Winter Board & Committee Meetings

2014 APGA Marketing Sales Trends and Training Conference & 2014 SIF Operations Conference

2014 Government Relations Conference & APGA Board and Committee Meetings
May 4 - 7, 2014 | Westin Arlington Gateway | Arlington, VA

2014 Annual Conference
July 20-23, 2014 | Resort at Squaw Creek Lake Tahoe | Olympic Valley, California

APGA Fall Board & Committee Meetings and Gas Utility Management Conference
November 2-5, 2014 | Sandestin Golf and Beach Resort | Destin, Florida

ABOUT APGA
APGA ANNUAL CONFERENCE
GENERAL SESSION PROGRAM

SUNDAY, JULY 28

12:00 PM REGISTRATION DESK OPEN & EXHIBIT SETUP
12:00 PM OPTIONAL TOURS & EXCURSIONS
5:30 PM WELCOME RECEPTION

MONDAY, JULY 29

7:00 AM CONTINENTAL BREAKFAST WITH EXHIBITORS
8:00 AM WELCOME TO THE APGA ANNUAL CONFERENCE!
   Pledge of Allegiance and National Anthem: Alonzo Weaver ~ Memphis, TN
   Moderator: Owen Reeves, APGA Chairman
   Gas System Director ~ Henderson Municipal Gas, KY
8:15 AM CHAIRMAN'S UPDATE: PROTECTING OUR FUTURE
   Owen Reeves, APGA Chairman
   Gas System Director ~ Henderson Municipal Gas, KY
8:45 AM NATURAL GAS SUPPLY & DEMAND
   Dragos Neacsu, Fundamentals Advisor ~ BP North America Gas & Power
9:30 AM NETWORKING BREAK WITH EXHIBITORS
9:55 AM MEMBER RECOGNITION & DOOR PRIZES
10:00 AM GILD OF ANCIENT SUPPLERS AWARD PRESENTATION
10:15 AM APGA SYSTEM OVERALL ACHIEVEMENT RECOGNITION (SOAR) AWARDS
10:45 AM 4-3-2-1 LEADERSHIP: TOOLS YOU CAN USE NOW
   Motivational Speaker ~ Major General Vinny Boles
11:45 AM GENERAL SESSION ADJOINS
12:00 PM OPTIONAL TOURS & EXCURSIONS / FREE TIME
1:00 PM GOLF TOURNAMENT: THE CLUB AT SPRUCE PEAK
APGA ANNUAL CONFERENCE
GENERAL SESSION PROGRAM

TUESDAY, JULY 30

7:00 AM  CONTINENTAL BREAKFAST WITH EXHIBITORS

8:00 AM  WELCOME!
Moderator: Sam Davis, APGA First Vice Chairman
General Manager & CEO ~ Lake Apopka Natural Gas District, Winter Garden, FL

8:15 AM  THREATS & TRENDS IN CALIFORNIA
George Minter, Regional Vice President, External Affairs and Environmental Strategy ~ Southern California Gas Company (SoCalGas)

9:00 AM  APGA AWARDS PRESENTATIONS:
- Public Gas System Achievement
- Personal Achievement
- Harry M. Cooke Personal Service
- Safety Management Excellence
- Marketing & Sales

9:45 AM  NETWORKING BREAK WITH EXHIBITORS

10:05 AM  MEMBER RECOGNITION & DOOR PRIZES

10:10 AM  RECOGNITION OF RETIRING APGA BOARD MEMBERS

10:15 AM  WHAT ARE WE DOING TO PROMOTE THE DIRECT USE OF NATURAL GAS?
Gerald Howard, CEO ~ National Association of Home Builders

11:00 AM  INNOVATION & CREATIVE THINKING: BEST APPROACHES TO PROBLEM SOLVING
Motivational Speaker ~ Chic Thompson

11:45 AM  GENERAL SESSION ADJOURNS

12:00 PM  CONCURRENT BREAKOUT SESSIONS & BOX LUNCH:
- Operations & Safety
- Government Relations Update
  David Holt, President ~ Consumer Energy Alliance
- APGA Past Chairmen Networking

2:30 PM  APGA BOARD OF DIRECTORS’ MEETING

5:30 PM  CHAIRMAN’S RECEPTION

6:30 PM  CHAIRMAN’S DINNER & ENTERTAINMENT
- APGA Distinguished Service Award Presentation
- Entertainment: Comedian Buzz Sutherland
APGA ANNUAL CONFERENCE
GENERAL SESSION PROGRAM

WEDNESDAY, JULY 31

7:00 AM  BREAKFAST BUFFET
8:00 AM  APGA RESEARCH FOUNDATION BOARD OF DIRECTORS’ MEETING
9:00 AM  THE PRESIDENT’S REPORT
         Bert Kalisch, President and CEO ~ American Public Gas Association
9:45 AM  APGA ANNUAL BUSINESS MEETING
10:30 AM ADJOURNMENT

APGA ANNUAL MEETING AGENDA

CALL TO ORDER: Owen Reeves, APGA Chairman

TREASURER’S REPORT: Alonzo Weaver, APGA Treasurer
          2019 Financial Report
          2020 Dues Proposal

APGA 2019-2020 RESOLUTIONS: John Leary, APGA 2nd Vice Chairman

NOMINATING COMMITTEE REPORT: Greg Henderson, APGA Past Chairman

PASSING THE GAVEL: Owen Reeves to Sam Davis

CHAIRMAN’S 2019-2020 THEME: Sam Davis, Incoming APGA Chairman

GRAND PRIZE DRAWINGS

CONFERENCE LOCATION:
   The Lodge at Spruce Peak (formerly Stowe Mountain Lodge)
   7412 Mountain Road | Stowe, Vermont 05672 | Phone: 802.760.4700 | www.sprucepeak.com

CONFERENCE INFORMATION:
   www.apga.org/stowe
   The conference hotel is currently sold out.
   A list of alternate accommodations may be found at www.gostowe.com.

If you currently have a hotel reservation but will not need it, please contact Sheila Deringis at sderingis@apga.org before cancelling with the hotel.
To: Members of the Direct Use Task Group  
From: Dan Lapato, APGA  
RE: December DUTG In-Person Meeting

Committee members,

Our December in-person DUTG meeting is scheduled for December 12th and will be held at:

McCarter & English’s DC office.  
1301 K Street, NW, Suite 1000 West  
Washington, DC 20005

Attached is the agenda for the meeting. We are planning on starting the meeting at 9:00am EST and ending at 3:00pm EST. The focus of the meeting is to briefly recap DUTG’s past work and then focus on crafting the task force’s next several years. In addition to our December 12th meeting, APGA will be hosting a dinner at 7:00 p.m. EST at McCormick & Schmicks in Crystal City, Virginia.

Below is the list of attendees to the meeting and the dinner. Please let me know if you are planning on attending the December 12 meeting and the December 11th dinner.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attendee</th>
<th>December 12th Meeting</th>
<th>December 11th Dinner</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dave Kearney</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sasha Benjamin</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mike Gundersen</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greg Stunder</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arthur Corbin</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barton Day</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dave Schryver</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neil Leslie</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Gregg</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. C. Anderson</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owen Reeves</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mike Clevens</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>Maybe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deanna Haines</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bert Kalisch</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erin Kurilla</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katy Garcia</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Leary</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sue Kristjansson</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Krebs</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyle Rodgers</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There are multiple hotel choices near McCarter & English's DC office however being mid-December many of their prices start at $300/night. For those who are interested, we are also including links to two hotels in nearby Crystal City (across the river in Virginia). Generally speaking it is about a 15 minute taxi/uber ride to McCarter & English's DC office.

Hotels:
Westin Crystal City
Crystal Gateway Marriott

Please contact me if you have any questions.

Thank you,
Dan

Daniel Lapato
Director of Government Affairs
American Public Gas Association
and Chief Operating Officer of the APGA Research Foundation
201 Massachusetts Avenue, NE, Suite C-4
Washington, DC 20002
202-464-2742

PLEASE JOIN US AT THESE UPCOMING APGA EVENTS:

APGA Winter Board and Committee Meetings
January 27-29, 2019 | The Westin Cape Coral | Cape Coral, FL | www.apga.org/capecoral2019

APGA Gas Supply Conference, Marketing & Sales Trends & Training Conference (MSTTC), and Policy & Technology Conference
January 29-31, 2019 | The Westin Cape Coral | Cape Coral, FL | www.apga.org/capecoral2019

APGA Spring Board & Committee Meetings and Government Relations Conference
May 5-8, 2019 | The Alexandrian | Alexandria, VA | www.apga.org/governmentrelations2019

2019 APGA Annual Conference
July 28-31, 2019 | Stowe Mountain Lodge | Stowe, VT | www.apga.org/stowe

ABOUT APGA
Attachment D – APGA, Slide Presentation for January 30, 2019 DUTG Meeting
Direct Use Task Group
January 30, 2019

American Public Gas Association

Westin Cape Coral Resort
Cape Coral, FL
DUTG - What is it?
DUTG Background

- 2013 - APGA Direct Use Task Force established to
  - Analyze threats facing the direct use of natural gas
  - Identify strategies to address threats
  - Final Report to APGA Board in May 2014

- 2014/2015 - Direct Use Task Group (DUTG) formed as a result of the findings.
Who are the participants?

- APGA members
- Investor-owned utilities
  - Spire
  - Southern California Gas Company
  - Chesapeake Utilities
  - In discussions with other IOU’s
- Also, partnered with AGA, NGSA, Propane Association, State Natural Gas Associations (AL, FL, GA & TN), various builder associations and Appliance Manufacturers Association on specific projects
Strategic Plan

- Mission: Counter the regulatory and legislative threats to the direct use of natural gas by advocating policies, regulations & legislation that promote natural gas direct use.

- GOALS:
  - Fair, balanced and transparent DOE rulemaking process for appliance efficiency standards
  - Legislation changing DOE efficiency parameters to include primary energy
  - Fair, balanced and transparent building codes and standards making processes
  - Eliminate legislative and regulatory restrictions to the direct use of natural gas
Annual Review
2018 Accomplishments

- Active in DOE proceedings
  - Multiple meetings with DOE regarding separation of advocacy and regulatory functions, appliance efficiency standards and the process for establishing standards
  - Participated in Process Rule proceeding through comments and testimony
- Filed Joint Petition for DOE Rulemaking on Separate Product Classes with AGA, NPGA and NGSA (also support from Appliance Manufacturer Associations)
- Completed Phases 1 & 2 of Genius Campaign consumer research and message development and began work on Phase 3 to launch campaign
- Helped finalize and socialize GTI’s air emissions reporting tool
- Hired contractor to develop state level LCOE tool to compare direct use to electrification
- Participated in World Gas Conference through paper and presentation
- Submitted comments and testified in California regulatory and legislative proceedings
Since Inception

- Furnace rule
- Gas policy and technology conference
- Onboarded a lobbyist
- Participated in California appliance standards hearing on instantaneous water heaters
- Filed petition with DOE re: modelling flaw “random vs economic decision making”
Strategic Priorities

- **Strategic Priority #1:**
  - Make the Direct Use of Natural Gas an integral part of U.S. Energy and Environmental Policy
    - Grow presence of direct use
  - Cultivate broad coalition of support
  - Enhance APGA’s role as subject matter expert and knowledge center for the direct use of natural gas
Strategic Priorities

- Strategic Priority #2:
  - Communicate the benefits of the Direct Use of Natural Gas for Society
    - Identify new and/or reform existing regulations, policies and rules that unfairly negatively affect the direct use of natural gas
  - Assess oppositional arguments
  - Examine the role of natural gas under various future policy and market scenarios
Next Steps on Strategic Plan

- Expand each actionable area with more detail
  - Specific tactics
  - Timelines and deadlines
  - Ownership
  - Assignment

- Project management system
  - This is not a spiral bound booklet that sits on a shelf!
Questions?
March 1, 2019

Mr. Eric Stas
U.S. Department of Energy
Office of the General Counsel
1000 Independence Avenue, SW
Washington, DC 20585-0121
via www.regulations.gov

Regulation Identifier Number: Not Assigned

Dear Mr. Stas:

The California Energy Commission is the primary energy policy and planning agency for the State of California. One of the chief mandates of the Energy Commission is to reduce the wasteful, uneconomic, inefficient, and unnecessary consumption of energy and water in the state by prescribing standards for minimum levels of operating efficiency for appliances that consume a significant amount of energy or water on a statewide basis.

The Commission strongly opposes the petition from the American Public Gas Association, American Gas Association, and other gas industry petitioners (Gas Industry Petitioners) to protect non-condensing technologies in residential furnaces and commercial water heaters as a performance characteristic or feature and to withdraw the U.S. Department of Energy’s (DOE’s) proposed rulemakings for both standards. The petition fails to produce any evidence or analysis either contrary or additional to that already contained in the federal rulemaking records, ignores or misunderstands DOE’s long-standing test for creating new product classifications, and ultimately requests that DOE take actions that are arbitrary and capricious when viewed in light of DOE’s substantial record on these appliances. The effect of granting the petition would be to put a cap on the energy efficiency of gas furnaces and water heaters by distinguishing products based on technologies that drive improvements in energy efficiency. This is an untenable approach to energy efficiency standards.
The issues Gas Industry Petitioners raise are neither novel nor recent. In the March 12, 2015, Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (NOPR) on proposed efficiency standards for residential non-weatherized gas furnaces, DOE provided a comprehensive account of its reasoning for not separating condensing and non-condensing furnaces into two product categories,¹ and did so again in its supplemental notice of proposed rulemaking (SNOPR) issued September 23, 2016.² Gas Industry Petitioners have previously made similar arguments with respect to commercial water heaters as well, and DOE similarly dismissed these arguments in its May 31, 2016, Notice of Proposed Rulemaking.³ In both rulemakings, DOE properly considered venting technology and installation as part of its cost analysis to determine if standards were economically justified. When including these installation costs, the proposed standards satisfied DOE’s applicable statutory and regulatory requirements for promulgating technologically feasible and economically justified standards. Gas Industry Petitioners’ request provides no new evidence or analysis that is not already contained in the federal rulemaking records and that has not already been fully considered by DOE.

Were DOE to nonetheless proceed to grant Gas Industry Petitioners’ request, it would be an arbitrary and capricious action under the federal Administrative Procedures Act (See 5 U.S.C. § 706.). The petition does not offer any new evidence, reasoning, or facts to support findings that could lead to a different conclusion than that already reached by DOE in its extensive and repeated treatment of this issue in both rulemaking records. See, Perez v. Mortgage Bankers Ass’n, 135 S.Ct. 1199, 1209 (2015).

DOE has consistently taken the position that the particular technology used to deliver utility to a consumer is not a basis for a product classification; rather than the method of providing the utility, the utility provided to the consumer is the determining factor, exclusive of manufacturer, installer, or even consumer costs. As discussed in both rulemakings, both condensing and non-condensing furnaces and commercial water heaters provide the same utility to the consumer—heating space or water. Condensing combustion products provide this utility at lower fuel costs due to increased fuel efficiency and lower environmental impacts due to reduced fuel consumption, resulting in significant direct and indirect benefits to American residents and businesses. As DOE notes, in contrast with residential clothes dryers, where in some cases consumers may have been denied the utility of the product (the ability to dry clothes) absent a different product classification, no such problem exists for venting technologies in furnaces or commercial water heaters. Rather, as analyzed by DOE in both rulemaking records, installation costs may be slightly higher—but the product functionality remains the same, so separate product classes are inappropriate under the Energy Policy and Conservation Act (EPCA).

² 81 Fed. Reg. 65752 (Sept. 23, 2016)
Moreover, the Gas Industry Petitioners are unlikely to be able to come up with any new evidence, reasoning, or analysis to support a different outcome than that already described by DOE in its rulemaking records:

- Commercially available products exist to address the so-called orphaned water heater scenario where a common chimney is being utilized by both an atmospherically vented furnace and water heater. The FasNSeal 80/90 by DuraVent allows for combined venting of an atmospheric appliance and a condensing appliance.\(^4\) This product was formally introduced at the 2015 AHR Expo industry event.\(^5\)
- In Canada, residential gas furnaces without an integrated cooling component and manufactured on or after December 31, 2012, are required to have a minimum Annual Fuel Utilization Efficiency (AFUE) of 90% (i.e., they must be condensing).\(^6\) There are more than five years of implementation of this mandatory standard from which to draw installation experience and solutions to any challenges.
- If there is a specific instance where it is impossible to install a condensing gas furnace, heat pump products are readily available as replacements. Gas Industry Petitioners have not provided evidence of such an instance, but have made clear their opposition to any solution that would rely on fuel-switching to electricity. Fuel-switching, however, is a cost impact, not a utility impact, as it does not disrupt service to the consumer of warm air or hot water. These costs were included in the DOE’s life-cycle cost analysis in its supplemental proposed rule for residential furnaces.

Gas Industry Petitioners have asked that DOE, contrary to the letter and intent of EPCA, lock in a particular technology and set a ceiling on the fuel efficiency of residential furnaces and commercial water heating equipment. Gas Industry Petitioners have not provided any additional evidence or information that consumers or businesses would be denied the utility of being able to heat their homes or heat water, and have not acknowledged readily available solutions. Rather, Gas Industry Petitioners request DOE abruptly issue interpretive rules and withdraw proposed standards on grounds that are neither necessary nor consistent with the evidentiary record and DOE’s previous well-supported reasoning. In short, granting this request would be arbitrary and capricious.

---


The Commission appreciates the opportunity to comment on this petition. If there are any questions about the attached comments, please contact Patrick Saxton at (916) 654-4274, or at Patrick.Saxton@energy.ca.gov.

Sincerely,

DAVID HOCHSCHILD
Chair