

**ADMIRALTY AUDUBON SOCIETY \* ALASKA RAINFOREST DEFENDERS \* ALASKA WILDERNESS LEAGUE \* AMERICAN ALPINE CLUB \* AUDUBON ALASKA \* BLACK HILLS AUDUBON \* CALIFORNIA WILDERNESS COALITION \* CASCADE FOREST CONSERVANCY \* CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY \* CENTER FOR SIERRA NEVADA CONSERVATION \* CHATTOOGA CONSERVANCY CHRISTIANS FOR THE MOUNTAINS \* CLARK-SKAMANIA FLYFISHERS \* COASTAL CUTTHROAT COALITION \* CONSERVATION NORTHWEST \* DEFENDERS OF WILDLIFE \* EARTH ISLAND INSTITUTE'S JOHN MUIR PROJECT \* EARTHJUSTICE \* ENVIRONMENT AMERICA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION INFORMATION CENTER \* FOREST ISSUES GROUP \* FRIENDS OF HEYBROOK RIDGE \* FRIENDS OF PLUMAS WILDERNESS \* FRIENDS OF THE BITTERROOT FRIENDS OF THE INYO \* FRIENDS OF WILD SKY \* GEORGIA FORESTWATCH \* GEOS INSTITUTE GRAND CANYON TRUST \* GREATER YELLOWSTONE COALITION \* GREAT OLD BROADS FOR WILDERNESS \* GREENLATINOS \* HIGH COUNTRY CONSERVATION ADVOCATES \* INDIVISIBLE SKAGIT \* INLAND EMPIRE FLY FISHING CLUB \* ISSAQUAH ALPS TRAILS CLUB \* KENTUCKY HEARTWOOD \* KETTLE RANGE CONSERVATION GROUP \* KITTITAS AUDUBON SOCIETY KLAMATH FOREST ALLIANCE \* KLAMATH-SISKIYOU WILDLANDS CENTER \* KCLICKITAT CHAPTER OF TROUT UNLIMITED \* LASSEN FOREST PRESENTATION GROUP \* LEAGUE OF CONSERVATION VOTERS \* LEAVENWORTH OUTFITTERS INC. \* LOWER COLUMBIA BASIN AUDUBON SOCIETY LOWER COLUMBIA FLYFISHERS \* NATIONAL AUDUBON SOCIETY \* NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL \* NEW MEXICO AUDUBON COUNCIL \* NEW MEXICO SPORTSMEN \* NEW MEXICO WILDERNESS ALLIANCE \* NORTH CASCADES AUDUBON \* NORTH CASCADES CONSERVATION COUNCIL \* NORTH CENTRAL WASHINGTON AUDUBON SOCIETY \* NORTHCOAST ENVIRONMENTAL CENTER \* NORTHWEST WATERSHED INSTITUTE \* OKANOGAN HIGHLANDS ALLIANCE \* OLYMPIC PARK ASSOCIATES \* OREGON WILD \* PACIFIC RIVERS \* PILCHUCK AUDUBON SOCIETY \* POLLY DYER CASCADIA BROAD BAND GREAT OLD BROADS FOR WILDERNESS \* PUGET SOUND FLYFISHERS \* RAINIER AUDUBON \* RIO GRANDE VALLEY BROADBAND GREAT OLD BROADS FOR WILDERNESS \* SAN JUAN CITIZENS ALLIANCE SAN LUIS VALLEY ECOSYSTEM COUNCIL \* SIERRA CLUB \* SIERRA CLUB-MT BAKER GROUP SIERRA FOREST LEGACY \* SKAGIT AUDUBON SOCIETY \* SODA MOUNTAIN WILDERNESS COUNCIL SOUTHEAST ALASKA CONSERVATION COUNCIL \* SWAN VIEW COALITION THE LANDS COUNCIL \* THE WILDERNESS SOCIETY \* UMPQUA WATERSHEDS \* VANCOUVER AUDUBON VASHON-MAURY ISLAND AUDUBON SOCIETY \* VIRGINIA WILDERNESS COMMITTEE WASHINGTON WILD \* WASHINGTON WILDLIFE FEDERATION \* WESTERN ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CENTER \* WEST VIRGINIA ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL \* WEST VIRGINIA HIGHLANDS CONSERVANCY \* WEST VIRGINIA RIVERS COALITION \* WEST VIRGINIA WILDERNESS COALITION WILD STEELHEAD COALITION \* WILDEARTH GUARDIANS \* WILDERNESS WORKSHOP WILDWATER RIVER GUIDES \* WINTER WILDLANDS ALLIANCE \* WOMEN'S EARTH AND CLIMATE ACTION NETWORK \* YAKIMA CHAPTER OF TROUT UNLIMITED**

April 10, 2018

Sonny Perdue, Secretary of Agriculture  
U.S. Department of Agriculture  
1400 Independence Avenue, SW  
Washington, DC 20250

Dear Secretary Perdue,

On behalf of millions of people across the country, we write to oppose the State of Alaska's petition for rulemaking to exempt the Tongass National Forest in Alaska from the Roadless Area Conservation Rule (the Roadless Rule or the Rule). Granting the petition will mire the U.S.

Department of Agriculture (USDA) in an exhaustive and unnecessary controversy. We urge you to deny the petition and maintain the Roadless Rule's important legacy of protecting our country's roadless areas.

The Roadless Rule, one of our country's most important conservation laws, was the product of three years of deliberation, more than one million public comments, and a robust administrative review of options for managing and protecting the approximately 58.5 million acres of inventoried roadless areas within the National Forest System. USDA concluded inventoried roadless areas serve numerous important functions, including providing unparalleled recreational and business opportunities, drinking water sources for millions of Americans, and habitat important to the long-term survival of innumerable fish and wildlife populations. USDA also concluded that the Rule responded to serious environmental, human safety, and fiscal concerns relating to the \$8.4 billion maintenance backlog on the existing forest road system.<sup>1</sup> USDA's thoughtful and deliberate approach to the Roadless Rule has withstood decades of legal challenges and stands as a lasting contribution to our country's conservation efforts.

In contrast, the State of Alaska's petition perpetuates stale, tired efforts by Roadless Rule opponents to mischaracterize the Rule's actual scope and effect. The petition ignores the fact that USDA narrowly tailored the Roadless Rule to limit only two activities in roadless areas, road construction/reconstruction and logging, because those activities pose the greatest likelihood of irretrievably altering and fragmenting roadless landscapes.<sup>2</sup> The petition also ignores the Rule's series of established exceptions that "honor existing law or address social or economic concerns."<sup>3</sup> Most importantly, for example, the State of Alaska ignores the fact that the Roadless Rule already allows for road connections between communities and other state highway projects, access to mining claims under the General Mining Law of 1872, and logging incidental to otherwise permitted activities, including utility corridors and hydropower projects.<sup>4</sup> As the U.S. Forest Service (Forest Service) itself recently noted, "[a]s of January 2018, 55 projects within roadless areas in Alaska have been submitted for Secretarial or Chief's review and all have been approved. . . . Under the current review process, most projects are approved by the Chief of the Forest Service within a month of submission."<sup>5</sup>

The State of Alaska's decision to ignore all of the Roadless Rule's existing exemptions makes it clear that the real purpose of the petition is to allow logging in the roadless portions of the Tongass. This poorly-veiled effort aims to prop up an industrial-scale old-growth logging program that has only one remaining mid-sized mill and contributed less than one percent in

---

<sup>1</sup> See generally Roadless Area Conservation Rule, 66 Fed. Reg. 3,244, 3,244–48 (Jan. 12, 2001).

<sup>2</sup> *Id.* at 3,244.

<sup>3</sup> *Id.*

<sup>4</sup> See *id.* at 3,255, 3,257-58, 3,264, 3,272–73.

<sup>5</sup> U.S. Forest Service Alaska Region, Frequently Asked Questions Regarding Inventoried Roadless Areas at 6 (Jan. 2018), [https://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE\\_DOCUMENTS/fseprd495343.pdf](https://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE_DOCUMENTS/fseprd495343.pdf).

employment-related earnings to the southeast Alaska economy in 2016.<sup>6</sup> The fact that the Tongass old-growth logging program is completely dependent on tens of millions of dollars in annual subsidies from U.S. taxpayers further eviscerates the petition's purported justification.<sup>7</sup>

For all of these reasons, the State of Alaska's petition for rulemaking should be denied. Initiating rulemaking regarding the Roadless Rule will drain USDA resources that are already stretched precariously thin. It will mire the Forest Service in a protracted, multi-year process to overturn long-standing and well-reasoned decisions, all but ensuring years of litigation. And given the complexity of USDA's existing administrative record, the sheer size of the Tongass in the overall National Forest System, and the unique contribution the Tongass plays in accomplishing the Roadless Rule's established goals and objectives, the environmental review associated with any exemption rulemaking would necessitate a national process, including public meetings held throughout the country. If, despite all of these concerns, USDA seeks to revisit the decision to apply the Roadless Rule to the crown jewel of the National Forest System, then it should provide a minimum scoping comment period of 90 days to ensure sufficient opportunity for communities, tribes, and the public to engage on an issue of such enormous controversy.

Finally, the State of Alaska's efforts to undermine the Roadless Rule by revising or amending the Tongass Land Management Plan (the Tongass Forest Plan) should also be denied. The Tongass Forest Plan reflects the unanimous recommendation of a diverse collaborative committee, including representatives from the State of Alaska and the timber industry, which unanimously recommended that the Forest Service should prohibit logging on roadless areas. The State of Alaska's post hoc efforts to disavow its own recommendations should be rejected.

We urge you to maintain the Roadless Rule and its vital protections for the National Forest System and the Tongass.

Respectfully,

Richard A. Jahnke  
President  
ADMIRALTY AUDUBON SOCIETY

Andy Moderow  
Alaska Director  
ALASKA WILDERNESS LEAGUE

Larry Edwards  
President  
ALASKA RAINFOREST DEFENDERS

Maria Povec  
Policy Director  
AMERICAN ALPINE CLUB

---

<sup>6</sup> See Southeast Conference, Southeast Alaska by the Numbers at 4 (Sept. 2017), <http://www.seconference.org/sites/default/files/Southeast%20Alaska%20by%20the%20numbers%202017%20FINAL.pdf>.

<sup>7</sup> See, e.g., U. S. Government Accountability Office, Tongass National Forest: Forest Service's Actions Related to its Planned Timber Program Transition at 7 (Apr. 2016), <https://www.gao.gov/assets/680/676788.pdf>.

Susan Culliney  
Policy Director  
AUDUBON ALASKA

Sam Merrill  
Chair, Conservation Committee  
BLACK HILLS AUDUBON

Linda Castro  
Assistant Policy Director  
CALIFORNIA WILDERNESS  
COALITION

Nicole Budine  
Policy and Campaign Manager  
CASCADE FOREST CONSERVANCY

Randi Spivak  
Director Public Lands Program  
CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY

Karen Schambach  
President  
CENTER FOR SIERRA NEVADA  
CONSERVATION

Nicole Hayler  
Executive Director  
CHATTOOGA CONSERVANCY

Allen Johnson  
Coordinator  
CHRISTIANS FOR THE MOUNTAINS

John Bohrsen  
President  
CLARK-SKAMANIA FLYFISHERS

Greg Shimek  
Executive Director  
COASTAL CUTTHROAT COALITION

Dave Werntz  
Science and Conservation Director  
CONSERVATION NORTHWEST

Peter Nelson  
Director of Federal Lands  
DEFENDERS OF WILDLIFE

Christy Sherr  
Outreach Coordinator  
EARTH ISLAND INSTITUTE'S JOHN  
MUIR PROJECT

Holly Harris  
Staff Attorney  
EARTHJUSTICE

Steve Blackledge  
Senior Director, Conservation America  
Campaign  
ENVIRONMENT AMERICA

Thomas Wheeler  
Executive Director  
ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION  
INFORMATION CENTER

Don Rivenes  
Executive Director  
FOREST ISSUES GROUP

Ann Darlington  
President of the Board of Directors  
FRIENDS OF HEYBROOK RIDGE

Darrel Jury  
President  
FRIENDS OF PLUMAS WILDERNESS

Jim Miller  
President  
FRIENDS OF THE BITTERROOT

Jora Fogg  
Policy Director  
FRIENDS OF THE INYO

Mike Town  
President  
FRIENDS OF WILD SKY

Mary A. Topa, Ph.D.  
Executive Director  
GEORGIA FORESTWATCH

Dominick A. DellaSala, Ph.D  
President, Chief Scientist  
GEOS INSTITUTE

Mary O'Brien  
Utah Forests Program Director  
GRAND CANYON TRUST

Darcie Warden  
Montana Conservation Coordinator  
GREATER YELLOWSTONE COALITION

Shelley Silbert  
Executive Director  
GREAT OLD BROADS FOR  
WILDERNESS

Mark Magaña  
President  
GREENLATINOS

Matt Reed  
Public Lands Director  
HIGH COUNTRY CONSERVATION  
ADVOCATES

Virginia Wolff  
Support Team Committee member  
INDIVISIBLE SKAGIT

Jim Athearn  
President  
INLAND EMPIRE FLY FISHING CLUB

John Sherwin  
President  
ISSAQUAH ALPS TRAILS CLUB

Jim Scheff  
Director  
KENTUCKY HEARTWOOD

Timothy Coleman  
Executive Director  
KETTLE RANGE CONSERVATION  
GROUP

Judy E Hallisey  
President  
KITITAS AUDUBON SOCIETY

Kimberly Baker  
Executive Director  
KLAMATH FOREST ALLIANCE

Joseph Vaile  
Executive Director  
KLAMATH-SISKIYOU WILDLANDS  
CENTER

Olivia Holderman  
President  
KLICKITAT CHAPTER OF TROUT  
UNLIMITED

Patricia Puterbaugh  
LASSEN FOREST PRESENTATION  
GROUP

Arian Rubio  
Legislative Associate, Lands  
LEAGUE OF CONSERVATION VOTERS

Duane A. Bolser  
Retired/Owner  
LEAVENWORTH OUTFITTERS INC.

Dana Carl Ward  
Conservation Chair  
LOWER COLUMBIA BASIN AUDUBON  
SOCIETY

Terry Frost  
President  
LOWER COLUMBIA FLYFISHERS

Sarah Greenberger  
Senior Vice President, Conservation Policy  
NATIONAL AUDUBON SOCIETY

Niel Lawrence  
Alaska Director and Senior Attorney  
NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE  
COUNCIL

Thomas Jervis, Ph.D.  
President  
NEW MEXICO AUDUBON COUNCIL

Oscar Simpson  
State Chair  
NEW MEXICO SPORTSMEN

Mark Allison  
Executive Director  
NEW MEXICO WILDERNESS  
ALLIANCE

Pam Borso  
President  
NORTH CASCADES AUDUBON

Tom Hammond  
President  
NORTH CASCADES CONSERVATION  
COUNCIL

Art Campbell  
President  
NORTH CENTRAL WASHINGTON  
AUDUBON SOCIETY

Dan Sealy  
Vice President of the Board  
NORTHCOAST ENVIRONMENTAL  
CENTER

Peter Bahls  
Executive Director  
NORTHWEST WATERSHED INSTITUTE

David Kliegman  
Executive Director  
OKANOGAN HIGHLANDS ALLIANCE

Donna Osseward  
President  
OLYMPIC PARK ASSOCIATES

Steve Pedery  
Conservation Director  
OREGON WILD

Greg Haller  
Conservation Director  
PACIFIC RIVERS

Cindy Easterson  
President  
PILCHUCK AUDUBON SOCIETY

Annie Cubberly  
Polly Dyer Cascadia Broad Band  
GREAT OLD BROADS FOR  
WILDERNESS

Greg Shimek  
President  
PUGET SOUND FLYFISHERS

Heather Gibson  
President  
RAINIER AUDUBON

Susan Ostlie  
Linda Starr  
Co-Leaders  
RIO GRANDE VALLEY BROADBAND  
GREAT OLD BROADS FOR  
WILDERNESS

Jimbo Buickerood  
Lands and Forest Protection Program  
Manager  
SAN JUAN CITIZENS ALLIANCE

Christine Canaly  
Director  
SAN LUIS VALLEY ECOSYSTEM  
COUNCIL

Athan Manuel  
Director, Lands Protection Program  
SIERRA CLUB

Judith Atkins  
President  
SIERRA CLUB – MT BAKER GROUP

Susan Britting, Ph.D.  
Executive Director  
SIERRA FOREST LEGACY

Timothy Manns  
Conservation Chair  
SKAGIT AUDUBON SOCIETY

Dave Willis  
Chair  
SODA MOUNTAIN WILDERNESS  
COUNCIL

Buck Lindekugel  
Grassroots Attorney  
SOUTHEAST ALASKA  
CONSERVATION COUNCIL

Keith Hammer  
Chair  
SWAN VIEW COALITION

Mike Petersen  
Executive Director  
THE LANDS COUNCIL

Megan Birzell  
Roadless Defense Campaign Manager  
THE WILDERNESS SOCIETY

Stanley Petrowski  
President  
UMPQUA WATERSHEDS

Eric Bjorkman  
President  
VANCOUVER AUDUBON

Julie Burman  
President  
VASHON-MAURY ISLAND AUDUBON  
SOCIETY

Mark Miller  
Executive Director  
VIRGINIA WILDERNESS COMMITTEE

Tom Uniack  
Executive Director  
WASHINGTON WILD

John McGlenn  
President  
WASHINGTON WILDLIFE  
FEDERATION

Susan Jane M. Brown  
Staff Attorney  
WESTERN ENVIRONMENTAL LAW  
CENTER

Keena Mullins  
President  
WEST VIRGINIA ENVIRONMENTAL  
COUNCIL

Larry V. Thomas  
President  
WEST VIRGINIA HIGHLANDS  
CONSERVANCY

Angie Rosser  
Executive Director  
WEST VIRGINIA RIVERS COALITION

Karen Yarnell  
Chair  
WEST VIRGINIA WILDERNESS  
COALITION

Rich Simms  
Founder/Board member  
WILD STEELHEAD COALITION

Marlies Wierenga  
Pacific Northwest Conservation Manager  
WILDEARTH GUARDIANS

Will Roush  
Conservation Director  
WILDERNESS WORKSHOP

Lance Reif  
Owner  
WILDWATER RIVER GUIDES

Hilary Eisen  
Policy Director  
WINTER WILDLANDS ALLIANCE

Osprey Orielle Lake  
Founder/Executive Director  
WOMEN'S EARTH AND CLIMATE  
ACTION NETWORK

Donna Broers  
President  
YAKIMA CHAPTER OF TROUT  
UNLIMITED